

ON SILENCE AND NOT SPEAKING

ABSTRACTS

From the Editors – Speaking of Silence... (P.M.)

Speaking of silence or not speaking is a paradoxical activity. It seems that those who believe that one ought not to speak, should just be silent rather than, against their own belief, multiply words that break the silence. Those, in turn, who claim that one should speak, usually do not encourage addressing the topic of silence; rather, they advocate speaking about what has been unjustly passed over in silence or concealed by not speaking. Thus speaking of silence or not speaking, if justifiable at all, should be extremely brief.

A paradoxical expression ‘speaking of silence,’ however, is in the first place a provocative play on words that carries a challenge to carefully follow the generally valid rule of conciseness. Yet it is not easy to speak briefly on silence or not speaking. Both concepts and the respective phenomena they grasp are of negative nature, i.e., are defined through absence: silence is the absence of sound, not speaking may refer not only to the absence of the uttered or written word, conceived of as a bearer of meaning, but also to the absence of thought. Thus while speaking of them, one naturally tends to refer to the entity whose absence defines them. “The eternal silence of... infinite spaces,”¹ which filled Pascal with dread, as he found them utterly non-human, makes one think of the essence of humanity, of the physical and metaphysical qualities that distinguish the human being from all other beings. Silence and not speaking are phenomena that seem to point to a borderline, to signal that a threshold has been reached: what lies beyond it exceeds the measure of the human being. Although we pass over in silence things that seem too obvious and ordinary to speak of, we also fall silent in the face of what is too beautiful or too terrible for words, or what is dramatically different from ourselves, or (as yet) unknown.

The reflection on the meaning of silence and non-speaking may draw inspiration from a Biblical story—one of the paradigmatic stories in the Western culture—of the first man, newly “formed out of the clay of the ground” (Gen 2:7) and placed in the garden of Eden. At the dawn of his being, man was presented with the task of giving names to all the animals living around him: “So the LORD God formed out of the ground various wild animals and various

¹ Blaise Pascal, *Pensées*, no. 201 (206), transl. by Alban J. Krailsheimer (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1995), 66.

birds of the air, and he brought them to the man to see what he would call them; whatever the man called each of them would be its name. The man gave names to all the cattle, all the birds of the air, and all the wild animals; but none proved to be the suitable partner for the man” (Gen 2:19-20).

Let us interrupt the Biblical quotation at this point —although it is probably the point where a particularly interesting part of the narrative begins—to focus on the first act of names giving in the history of the humankind. One of its interpretations explains it as an expression of man’s gaining insight into the essence of each creature God brought before him, and at the same time of becoming aware of his own identity and subjectivity: “The created man finds himself from the first moment of his existence before God in search of his own being, as it were; one could say, in search of his own definition.”² In this context the first act of giving names may also be considered as the first act of creating the human culture. Through this act man refers all the creatures to himself, to the knowledge of himself he has obtained, and defines their place in his world. Giving names is thus also an expression of his supremacy over God’s creation, or, one might say: it is the act of assuming responsibility for the creation.

The story about giving names to creatures, that is, a story on speaking, shows also the power of silence and not speaking, thus placing them in the context of the very beginning of the existence of the world, man and the human culture. Its history shows that man is capable of using silence and not speaking in order to find the truth about the reality and also to appreciate it, perhaps even to marvel over its beauty, transforming this knowledge and admiration into the source of his creativity. Man can also use silence and not speaking as a way to conceal the truth and destroy other human beings. By being silent or forbidding others to speak, man can prevent them from obtaining justice, break their consciences, push them into penury, or even cause their death. He is also capable of excluding individuals and whole groups from the cultural universe, of manipulating the memory of past events or ‘erasing’ them from history. Numerous examples of making such use of silence or non-speaking can be provided. Instead of naming them, let us quote a bitter distich by Anna Akhmatova written in the late the nineteen-sixties: “Speechlessness became my home / And my capital—muteness.”³

Akhmatova’s words, directing the attention of her readers beyond the literal meaning of the text and making them guess what the poet has passed over in silence, at the same time bring to mind the positive sense of silence and not speaking, which seems also their primary and proper meaning. Although they can be used to deprive one of freedom, they originally point to the safety associated with the notion of home: they protect the human spirit, fostering inner peace and thus encouraging thought and free choice.

² John Paul II, *The Theology of the Body*, transl. by Michael Waldstein (Boston: Pauline Books & Media, 2006), 149.

³ Anna Akhmatova, *Speechlessness became my home...* in *The Complete Poems of Anna Akhmatova*, transl. by Judith Hemschemeyer (Boston: Zephyr Press, Canongate Books Ltd.: Edinburgh, 2000), 767.

Such silence and not speaking are difficult to find today. Noise seems to have become almost the natural 'element' of human life, and is no longer perceived as a factor that contaminates the specifically human environment. And although there are people who, oppressed by the excess of sounds and words, seek, sometimes in vain, respite from them, everyday experience offers a different image of contemporary man: he is a creature that speaks incessantly, and is equipped with devices that allow him, in any situation, to buzz, ring and make a variety of other sounds, from cock-crows to tam-tam beating. Deprived of this, he feels uneasy and lost. In the environment filled with noise, he wishes to delimit his own space; in order to achieve this he carries on himself the devices that emit the sound corresponding to his tastes, which, fortunately, he can listen to 'privately.' Some, however, dissatisfied with listening to music on their earphones, attempt to overcome the noise of the environment with the noise they happen to like.

Silence and not speaking are also rare in the context of using words as meaningful sounds. Contemporary culture strongly encourages speaking, putting feelings into words, and expressing opinions. This is a consequence not only of the widely enjoyed freedom of speech, but also of the availability and the nature of the devices that facilitate recording and broadcasting messages. As a result of the 'encouragement' they apparently offer an act of speech assumes the nature of an immediate response to a stimulus. The demand to provide live commentary to facts as they are happening, whether occasioned by an outside pressure or by our own need, significantly restricts our linguistic resources: we are forced to use either ready-made clichés, or the first words that come to mind, hoping that they will somehow express our vague, 'incomplete' thoughts. In the past, commentaries of this kind were at times considered as necessary, and at times as, at most, justified; today, they are much appreciated, or one could say, exaggerating only slightly, that they are believed to be most valuable. Indeed, what may be the use of outdated opinions on obsolete facts, especially in view—as one might self-ironically add—of the excess of words characteristic of present-day culture, which is the target of our critique?

A description of the contemporary world would be incomplete without a reference to the phenomenon of noise. Our world is one in which making noise has become almost a human need, or, more accurately speaking, an addiction. Like other addictions, it attracts man, as it appears to have the power to alleviate some of his pains. Yet the opposite pole of this addiction to another illusion is the authentic need, still inherent in our culture, for silence and for abstaining from speaking—as well as the need to remember their proper meaning. Thus the description of our world would be also incomplete without our speaking of silence. Perhaps it was for this reason that many authors welcomed the idea of addressing these themes in *Ethos* and accepted the Editors' invitation to participate in the project. However, some of the interesting ideas that emerged in the discussions with prospective authors did not find their conclusion in the form of an article. In the process of preparing a volume for publication such failures are not extraordinary, but on this occasion they seem to have been more frequent than usual. Thus while the presented reflection on silence and non-speaking is rich and diversified, some voices are still missing. The question remains

whether this fact is to be understood as a symbolic, paradoxical fulfilment of our project, or as an equally paradoxical sign of the times.

JOHN PAUL II – “All need to learn a silence”

In the liturgical experience, Christ the Lord is the light which illumines the way and reveals the transparency of the cosmos, precisely as in Scripture. The events of the past find in Christ their meaning and fullness, and creation is revealed for what it is: a complex whole which finds its perfection, its purpose in the liturgy alone. This is why the liturgy is heaven on earth, and in it the Word who became flesh imbues matter with a saving potential which is fully manifest in the sacraments: there, creation communicates to each individual the power conferred on it by Christ. Thus the Lord, immersed in the Jordan, transmits to the waters a power which enables them to become the bath of baptismal rebirth.⁴

Within this framework, liturgical prayer in the East shows a great aptitude for involving the human person in his or her totality: the mystery is sung in the loftiness of its content, but also in the warmth of the sentiments it awakens in the heart of redeemed humanity. In the sacred act, even bodiliness is summoned to praise, and beauty, which in the East is one of the best loved names expressing the divine harmony and the model of humanity transfigured,⁵ appears everywhere: in the shape of the church, in the sounds, in the colors, in the lights, in the scents. The lengthy duration of the celebrations, the repeated invocations, everything expresses gradual identification with the mystery celebrated with one's whole person. Thus the prayer of the Church already becomes participation in the heavenly liturgy, an anticipation of the final beatitude.

This total involvement of the person in his rational and emotional aspects, in “ecstasy” and in immanence, is of great interest and a wonderful way to understand the meaning of created realities: these are neither an absolute nor a den of sin and iniquity. In the liturgy, things reveal their own nature as a gift offered by the Creator to humanity: “God saw everything that he had made, and behold, it was very good” (Gen 1:31). Though all this is marked by the tragedy of sin, which weighs down matter and obscures its clarity, the latter is redeemed in the Incarnation and becomes fully “theophoric,” that is, capable of putting us in touch with the Father. This property is most apparent in the holy mysteries, the sacraments of the Church.

Christianity does not reject matter. Rather, bodiliness is considered in all its value in the liturgical act, whereby the human body is disclosed in its inner nature as a temple of the Spirit and is united with the Lord Jesus, who himself took a body for the world's salvation. This does not mean, however, an absolute exaltation of all that is physical, for we know well the chaos which sin introduced into the harmony of the human being. The liturgy reveals that the body, through the mystery of the Cross, is in the process of transfiguration,

⁴ See St. Gregory of Nazianzus, *Discourse XXXIX*.

⁵ See Clement of Alexandria, *The Pedagogue*, III, 1, 1.

pneumatization: on Mount Tabor Christ showed his body radiant, as the Father wants it to be again.

Cosmic reality also is summoned to give thanks because the whole universe is called to recapitulation in Christ the Lord. This concept expresses a balanced and marvelous teaching on the dignity, respect and purpose of creation and of the human body in particular. With the rejection of all dualism and every cult of pleasure as an end in itself, the body becomes a place made luminous by grace and thus fully human.

To those who seek a truly meaningful relationship with themselves and with the cosmos, so often disfigured by selfishness and greed, the liturgy reveals the way to the harmony of the new man, and invites him to respect the Eucharistic potential of the created world. That world is destined to be assumed in the Eucharist of the Lord, in his Passover, present in the sacrifice of the altar.

The monk turns his gaze to Christ, God and man. In the disfigured face of Christ, the man of sorrow, he sees the prophetic announcement of the transfigured face of the Risen Christ. To the contemplative eye, Christ reveals himself as he did to the women of Jerusalem, who had gone up to contemplate the mysterious spectacle on Calvary. Trained in this school, the monk becomes accustomed to contemplating Christ in the hidden recesses of creation and in the history of mankind, which is then understood from the standpoint of identification with the whole Christ.

This gaze progressively conformed to Christ thus learns detachment from externals, from the tumult of the senses, from all that keeps man from that freedom which allows him to be grasped by the Spirit. Walking this path, he is reconciled with Christ in a constant process of conversion: in the awareness of his own sin and of his distance from the Lord which becomes heartfelt remorse, a symbol of his own baptism in the salutary water of tears; in silence and inner quiet, which is sought and given, where he learns to make his heart beat in harmony with the rhythm of the Spirit, eliminating all duplicity and ambiguity. This process of becoming ever more moderate and sparing, more transparent to himself, can cause him to fall into pride and intransigence if he comes to believe that these are the fruits of his own ascetic efforts. Spiritual discernment in continuous purification then makes him humble and meek, aware that he can perceive only some aspects of that truth which fills him, because it is the gift of the Spouse, who alone is fulfillment and happiness.

To the person who is seeking the meaning of life, the East offers this school which teaches one to know oneself and to be free and loved by that Jesus who says: "Come to me, all who labor and are heavy laden, and I will give you rest" (Mt 11:28). He tells those who seek inner healing to go on searching: if their intention is upright and their way is honest, in the end the Father's face will let itself be recognized, engraved as it is in the depths of the human heart.

A monk's way is not generally marked by personal effort alone. He turns to a spiritual father to whom he abandons himself with filial trust, in the certainty that God's tender and demanding fatherhood is manifested in him. This figure gives Eastern monasticism an extraordinary flexibility: through the spiritual father's intervention the way of each monk is in fact strongly personalized in the times, rhythms and ways of seeking God. Precisely because the spiritual father

is the harmonizing link, monasticism is permitted the greatest variety of cenobitic and eremitical expressions. Monasticism in the East has thus been able to fulfill the expectations of each church in the various periods of its history.⁶

In this quest, the East in particular teaches that there are brothers and sisters to whom the Spirit has granted the gift of spiritual guidance. They are precious points of reference, for they see things with the loving gaze with which God looks at us. It is not a question of renouncing one's own freedom in order to be looked after by others. It is benefiting from the knowledge of the heart, which is a true charism, in order to be helped, gently and firmly, to find the way of truth. Our world desperately needs such spiritual guides. It has frequently rejected them, for they seemed to lack credibility or their example appeared out of date and scarcely attractive to current sensitivities. Nevertheless, it is having a hard time finding new ones, and so suffers in fear and uncertainty, without models or reference points. He who is a father in the Spirit, if he really is such—and the people of God have always shown their ability to recognize him—will not make others equal to himself, but will help them find the way to the Kingdom.

Of course, the wonderful gift of male and female monastic life, which safeguards the gift of guidance in the Spirit and calls for appropriate recognition, has also been given to the West. In this context and wherever grace has inspired these precious means of interior growth, may those in charge foster this gift and use it to good advantage, and may all avail themselves of it. Thus they will experience the great comfort and support of fatherhood in the Spirit on their journey of faith.⁷

Precisely in gradual detachment from those worldly things which stand in the way of communion with his Lord, the monk finds the world a place where the beauty of the Creator and the love of the Redeemer are reflected. In his prayers the monk utters an epiklesis of the Spirit on the world and is certain that he will be heard, for this is a sharing in Christ's own prayer. Thus he feels rising within himself a deep love for humanity, that love which Eastern prayer so often celebrates as an attribute of God, the friend of men who did not hesitate to offer his Son so that the world might be saved. In this attitude the monk is sometimes enabled to contemplate that world already transfigured by the deifying action of Christ, who died and rose again.

Whatever path the Spirit has in store for him, the monk is always essentially the man of communion. Since antiquity this name has also indicated the monastic style of cenobitic life. Monasticism shows us how there is no true vocation that is not born of the Church and for the Church. This is attested by the experience of so many monks who, within their cells, pray with an extraordinary passion, not only for the human person but for every creature, in a ceaseless cry, that all may be converted to the saving stream of Christ's love. This path of inner libera-

⁶ For example, Anthony's or Pachomius's experiences are significant. See Saint Athanasius, *Life of Anthony*, 15; *Les vies coptes de saint Pakhôme et ses successeurs*, ed. Louis Th. Lefort (Louvain: Bibliothèque du Muséon, 1943), 3; and the witness of Evagrius of Pontus, *Practical Treatise*, 100.

⁷ See John Paul II, Homily to Religious during the celebration of the divine liturgy Syro-Maronite rite on the Feast of the Presentation of the Lord (Vatican, February 2, 1988).

tion in openness to the Other makes the monk a man of charity. In the school of Paul the Apostle, who showed that love is the fulfilling of the law (cf. Rom 13:10), Eastern monastic communion has always been careful to guarantee the superiority of love over every law.

This communion is revealed first and foremost in service to one's brothers in monastic life, but also to the Church community, in forms which vary in time and place, ranging from social assistance to itinerant preaching. The Eastern Churches have lived this endeavor with great generosity, starting with evangelization, the highest service that the Christian can offer his brother, followed by many other forms of spiritual and ministerial service. Indeed it can be said that monasticism in antiquity—and at various times in subsequent ages too—has been the privileged means for the evangelization of peoples.

The monk's life is evidence of the unity that exists in the East between spirituality and theology: the Christian, and the monk in particular, more than seeking abstract truths, knows that his Lord alone is Truth and Life, but also knows that he is the Way (cf. Jn 14:6) to reach both; knowledge and participation are thus a single reality: from the person to the God who is three Persons through the Incarnation of the Word of God.

The East helps us to express the Christian meaning of the human person with a wealth of elements. It is centered on the Incarnation, from which creation itself draws light. In Christ, true God and true man, the fullness of the human vocation is revealed. In order for man to become God, the Word took on humanity. Man, who constantly experiences the bitter taste of his limitations and sin, does not then abandon himself to recrimination or to anguish, because he knows that within himself the power of divinity is at work. Humanity was assumed by Christ without separation from his divine nature and without confusion,⁸ and man is not left alone to attempt, in a thousand often frustrated ways, an impossible ascent to heaven. There is a tabernacle of glory, which is the most holy person of Jesus the Lord, where the divine and the human meet in an embrace that can never be separated. The Word became flesh, like us in everything except sin. He pours divinity into the sick heart of humanity, and imbuing it with the Father's Spirit enables it to become God through grace.

But if this has revealed the Son to us, then it is given us to approach the mystery of the Father, principle of communion in love. The Most Holy Trinity appears to us then as a community of love: to know such a God means to feel the urgent need for him to speak to the world, to communicate himself; and the history of salvation is nothing but the history of God's love for the creature he has loved and chosen, wanting it to be "according to the icon of the Icon"—as the insight of the Eastern Fathers expresses it⁹—that is, molded in the image of the Image, which is the Son, brought to perfect communion by the sanctifier, the Spirit of love. Even when man sins, this God seeks him and loves him, so that the rela-

⁸ Cf. *Symbolum Chalcedonense*, in *Enchiridion Symbolorum, definitionum et declarationum de rebus fidei et morum*, ed. Heinrich J.D. Denzinger and Adolf Schönmetzer (Freiburg: Herder, 1965), 301-302.

⁹ See Saint Irenaeus, *Against Heresies* V, 16, 2; IV, 33, 4; Saint Athanasius, *Against the Gentiles*, 2-3, and 34; Saint Athanasius, *The Incarnation of the Word*, 12-13.

tionship may not be broken off and love may continue to flow. And God loves man in the mystery of the Son, who let himself be put to death on the Cross by a world that did not recognize him, but has been raised up again by the Father as an eternal guarantee that no one can destroy love, for anyone who shares in it is touched by God's glory: it is this man transformed by love whom the disciples contemplated on Tabor, the man whom we are all called to be.

Nevertheless this mystery is continuously veiled, enveloped in silence,¹⁰ lest an idol be created in place of God. Only in a progressive purification of the knowledge of communion, will man and God meet and recognize in an eternal embrace their unending connaturality of love.

Thus is born what is called the apophatism of the Christian East: the more man grows in the knowledge of God, the more he perceives him as an inaccessible mystery, whose essence cannot be grasped. This should not be confused with an obscure mysticism in which man loses himself in enigmatic, impersonal realities. On the contrary, the Christians of the East turn to God as Father, Son and Holy Spirit, living persons tenderly present, to whom they utter a solemn and humble, majestic and simple liturgical doxology. But they perceive that one draws close to this presence above all by letting oneself be taught an adoring silence, for at the culmination of the knowledge and experience of God is his absolute transcendence. This is reached through the prayerful assimilation of scripture and the liturgy more than by systematic meditation.

In the humble acceptance of the creature's limits before the infinite transcendence of a God who never ceases to reveal himself as God—Love, the Father of our Lord Jesus Christ in the joy of the Holy Spirit, I see expressed the attitude of prayer and the theological method which the East prefers and continues to offer all believers in Christ.

We must confess that we all have need of this silence, filled with the presence of him who is adored: in theology, so as to exploit fully its own sapiential and spiritual soul; in prayer, so that we may never forget that seeing God means coming down the mountain with a face so radiant that we are obliged to cover it with a veil (cf. Ex 34:33), and that our gatherings may make room for God's presence and avoid self-celebration; in preaching, so as not to delude ourselves that it is enough to heap word upon word to attract people to the experience of God; in commitment, so that we will refuse to be locked in a struggle without love and forgiveness. This is what man needs today; he is often unable to be silent for fear of meeting himself, of feeling the emptiness that asks itself about meaning; man who deafens himself with noise. All, believers and non-believers alike, need to learn a silence that allows the Other to speak when and how he wishes, and allows us to understand his words.

Keywords: Eastern liturgy, Eastern monasticism, eremites, cenobitic life, apophatism, spiritual guidance, divine harmony, ecstasy, transfiguration, pneumatization, meditation, adoring silence

¹⁰ Silence (*hesychia*) is an essential component of Eastern monastic spirituality. See *The Life and Sayings of the Desert Fathers*, in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 65, col. 72-456. See also Evagrius of Pontus, *The Foundations of Monastic Life*, in *Patrologia Graeca*, vol. 40, col. 1252-1264.

Extracts from the Apostolic Letter *Oriente Lumen* (Sections 11-16). Reprinted from: *L'Osservatore Romano*, Polish Edition, 16, no. 6 (1995): 36-29. For the English text, see https://w2.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/en/apost_letters/1995/documents/hf_jp-ii_apl_19950502_orientale-lumen.html.
© Copyright 1995 by Libreria Editrice Vaticana

Jaromir BREJDAK – The Logos of Communicative Silence

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-03

The article focuses on the phenomenon of not speaking and its various forms. The author puts forward the thesis that not speaking is a form of communication, including the communication of non-communicability. The communicative aspect of silence is discussed in the context of the silence of nature, human not speaking, and the silence of God. The substantiality of various forms of silence is in turn analyzed from the perspective of various forms of communal being in which the category of attentiveness plays the fundamental role. In the concluding part of the text, silence and not speaking are considered in various ontological horizons. Apart from the dialogical and religious horizons of silence, the hermeneutic, phenomenological and historical aspects of this phenomenon are sketched.

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajka*

Keywords: communicative silence, the silence of God, human not speaking, the silence of nature, the attentiveness of silence, communal emotionality, the ontological horizon of silence and not speaking, Martin Buber, Max Scheler

Contact: Department of Contemporary Philosophy, Institute of Philosophy, Faculty of Humanities, University of Szczecin, ul. Krakowska 71/79, 71-017 Szczecin, Poland

E-mail: jaromir.brejdak@univ.szczecin.pl

Grażyna OSIKA – Not Speaking as an Embodied Identity-Building Practice

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-04

This article focuses on the role of silence in building personal identity. Humans intuitively feel that there is a relation between silence and self-identity, and different kinds of spiritual practices pursued everywhere in the world prove the permanence of this conviction. It seems that there is a good reason to try and understand the basis of the relation between silence and self-identity by seeking the answer to the question of what happens when we cease talking and what allows us to 'look deeper in our selves.' In the present considerations silence is defined as abstaining from speaking. As such, it creates a space that helps the human being open up to various types of experiencing the world and the self, without recourse to words.

The approach used throughout the analyses rests on the assumption that the body, in particular embodied proprioception, an unmediated experience of the body's internal sense of itself, is a decisive factor in establishing the human self. Proprioception reveals the layers of identity which in everyday experience are hidden either by the words spoken by others or in the internal dialogue with oneself. The article describes how proprioception is a basic source of self-knowledge accessible as a result of a conscious practice of silence.

Keywords: silence, personal identity, identity practice, communication, proprioception, Maurice Merleau-Ponty

Contact: Katedra Stosowanych Nauk Społecznych, Wydział Organizacji i Zarządzania, Politechnika Śląska, ul. Roosevelta 26-28, building A, room 219, 41-800 Zabrze, Poland
E-mail: gra.o@poczta.fm
Phone: +48 32 2777323
<https://scholar.google.pl/citations?user=UBcL3bMAAAAJ&hl=en>

Dariusz KOSIŃSKI – The Rest is Silence

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-05

The article focuses on silence analyzed primarily in the context of Western drama theatre, which is mainly 'spoken word theatre.' The first field and the main form in which silence appears in 'spoken word theatre' is the so-called 'silent play' embracing face expression and gesture. In the course of the evolution of stage acting, they gradually became proofs of the actors' artistry and creative originality. Developed by masters of the 19th century stage (in Poland, in particular by Alojzy Żółkowski, Jr), the 'silent play' became especially important in the modernist drama. Playwrights were using it as the tool to show the ambivalent reactions of their characters or to express deep symbolic meanings. Another aspect of theatrical silence is that connected with death and its figures (such as ghosts, specters, living dead etc.) appearing on the stage. Sometimes (for instance in the *Forefathers' Eve* by Adam Mickiewicz) they introduce enveloping silence, a mysterious silence of the unspeakable, to the center of the stage. This silence is no longer 'the silence of death' though; rather, it is an entirety encompassing the silence of the audience, and as such it is accessible to human experience. The introduction of this kind of silence onto the stage opens up the possibility of making the stage a philosophical place.

Keywords: drama theatre, silence, silent play, modernist drama, *Forefathers' Eve* by Adam Mickiewicz

Contact: Katedra Performatyki, Wydział Polonistyki, Uniwersytet Jagielloński, ul. Gołębia 14, room 69, 30-007 Kraków, Poland
E-mail: dariusz.kosinski@uj.edu.pl
<http://www.performatyka.polonistyka.uj.edu.pl/p-kosinski>

Kinga KIWAŁA – Music and Silence: On the Dimensions of Silence in Music
DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-06

The subject of the article is a multidimensional approach to the dialectics of silence and sound in music. Musical silence, manifested among others by a rest (pause), should be distinguished both from objective physical silence (which is not part of music) and from the so-called ‘music related’ silence, constituted in the ‘performer–listener,’ relation characteristic of the moment just before and directly after the composition is performed. The inner silence of a musical work has many functions, of which the most important seems to be its constructional and expressional (energetic) role. However, the inner silence of a musical work may also hold semantic and symbolic functions; in exceptional situations Ingardenian metaphysical qualities may also constitute themselves on the basis of such silence. The article also discusses the space and time nature of musical silence, including its crucial role in constituting an impression of depth in music. The article concludes with a short examination of some theological and philosophical approaches to the dialectics of music and silence, including the fundamental treatment of the problem in the phenomenological thought. References to specific concepts and compositions by 20th-century composers (Anton Webern, John Cage, Krzysztof Penderecki, Henryk Mikołaj Górecki, Eugeniusz Knapik, and others) exemplify the discussed interpretations.

Keywords: sound, silence, musical space and time, musical semantics, metaphysical qualities

Contact: Music Theory and Interpretation Department, Institute of Composition, Conducting and Music Theory, Composition, Interpretation and Musical Education Faculty, Academy of Music, ul. św. Tomasza 43, 31-027 Cracow, Poland

E-mail: kinga.kiwala@amuz.krakow.pl

Phone: +48 12 4223837

<http://www.amuz.krakow.pl/wydzialy/wydzial-i-tworczosci-interpretacji-i-edukacji-muzycznej/institut-kompozycji-dyrygentury-i-teorii-muzyki/katedra-teorii-i-interpretacji-dziela-muzycznego/dr-kinga-kiwala/>

Łukasz NIEWCZAS – Silence and Metaphor: On the Imagery in Norwid’s Two Texts on Chopin

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-07

The author notes that despite the abundant literary criticism on Norwid’s treatment of the issues of silence and not speaking the analysis of the formal, textual means he used in order to evoke silence in his poetry is rather sparse. Thus the article focuses on a discussion of the specific Norwidian imagery which the poet employed to articulate silence and not speaking. The paper comprises a presentation of the poetics of the metaphor of silence in the two pieces Norwid devoted to Frédéric Chopin, namely his *Nekrolog* [“Obituary”], which is

a necrology written, in prose, after the composer's death, and the famous poem *Chopin's Grand Piano*. Both texts are similar in that their meaning is metaphor based. However, the construction of the imagery is governed by a different poetics in the case of each text. The vivid, emphatic and strongly conventionalized imagery of the *Nekrolog* is contrasted with the discrete, subtle, and ephemeral imagery of *Chopin's Grand Piano*, the latter considered by the author of the article as exhibiting an absolutely original approach to poetry in the mid- and late 19th century. The 'silent,' or rather 'invisible,' imagery used in Norwid in *Chopin's Grand Piano* is representative of his mature works (in particular those included in the volume entitled *Vade-mecum*), and as such constitutes the main element of his poetic idiom.

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajska*

Keywords: Norwid, silence, metaphor, imagery, Chopin, *Chopin's Grand Piano*, the *Nekrolog* ["Obituary"] of Chopin

Contact: Institute for the Study of Cyprian Norwid's Literature, Faculty of Humanities, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin, ul. Chopina 27, 20-023 Lublin, Poland

E-mail: lukasznieuczynas@kul.pl

Phone: + 48 81 7436062

http://www.kul.pl/art_21667.html

Agnieszka K. HAAS – The Silent Body Language: On the Prose of German Romanticism

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-08

Today, we live in an age of increased fascination with the body, which is vividly manifested in various areas of culture. However, seeking the reasons for such a situation in the transvaluation of higher values would amount to simplification. Rather, the interest in the body reveals the need to define human identity. The body as a primordial medium enabling the reception of various stimuli through its special qualities that pertain to perception, aesthetic evaluation and communication, and thus accumulating experience in the human being's relation to the external world, has always provided an area of interest for artists, and, increasingly, for literary scholars. Reception and evaluation of sensory stimuli, as well as intersubjective expression, are feasible owing to the body which exists in time and space. Being a major identity determinant, the body has become an inherent element of the textual world, which—while governed by its own rules—enables transgression of the barriers in the real world. Therefore non-verbal social communication as shown in literary texts has at least a double meaning: it can not only complement the verbal message, but also assume nonfactual qualities, for instance when it becomes a symbol, or a metaphor of the human condition, or the projection of a desire to transgress the borders of the empirical word. Therefore categories taken from psychology are not always

sufficient to explain the meaning of the body language of literary characters. Instances of the above tendencies are discussed in the present article, based on German literature of the turn of the 19th century.

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajska*

Keywords: body language, Romanticism, anthropology, Johann Wolfgang Goethe, Johann Gottfried Herder, Wilhelm W. Wackenroder, Ludwig A. von Arnim, Clemens Brentano, Ernst T.A. Hoffmann

Contact: Katedra Literatury i Kultury Niemieckiej, Instytut Filologii Germańskiej, Wydział Filologiczny, Uniwersytet Gdański, ul. Wita Stwosza 51, 80-308 Gdańsk, Poland
E-mail: filah@univ.gda.pl
Phone: +48 58 5232181
http://ug.edu.pl/pracownik/1016/agnieszka_haas

Dorota KORWIN-PIOTROWSKA – Silence and Non-Silence of Contemporaneity
DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-09

The article presents the characteristics of the relationship between the so-called *piercing silence* (individual and collective) and non-silence, which is understood as the breaking of silence. Three issues are focused on from this perspective: the problem of the contemporary word crisis (which dates back as far as the turn of the 19th century); the issues of the tensions between silence and language in view of the ‘linguistic turn’ in the second half of the 20th century and its consequences in the humanities; the connection between silence and the non-anthropocentric approach in cultural studies.

Keywords: silence, non-silence, piercing silence, anthropology of silence, linguistic turn, humanism, posthumanism

Contact: Chair in Computational Linguistics, Faculty of Management and Social Communication, Jagiellonian University, ul. S. Łojasiewicza 4, 30-348 Cracow, Poland
E-mail: korwin@uj.edu.pl
Phone: +48 12 6645667; +48 12 6645848

Marek M. DZIEKAN – Al-Jāhiz and his Treatise *Keeping Secrets and Holding the Tongue*
DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-10

The article comprises a Polish translation of the Arabic treatise *Kitnan as-sirr wa-hafz al-lisan* [*Keeping Secrets and Holding the Tongue*] by Abu Usman al-Jāhiz, an Arabic intellectual of the turn of the 9th century. The treatise is

an interesting example of medieval Arabic-Muslim paraenetic literature, and the reflection it offers addresses ethics, philosophy and theology, as seen from the Eastern perspective. The translation of the treatise is preceded by an introduction providing the basic information on al-Jāhiz and the circumstances in which the text in question was written. Its historical and cultural context is also discussed.

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajska*

Keywords: al-Jāhiz, Arabs, Islam, ethics, mystery, not speaking and silence, paraenetic literature

Contact: Katedra Bliskiego Wschodu i Północnej Afryki, Wydział Studiów Międzynarodowych i Politologicznych, Uniwersytet Łódzki, ul. Narutowicza 59a, 90-131 Łódź, Poland

E-mail: mmdziekan@interia.pl

Phone: +48 42 6354232

<http://www.kbwipa.uni.lodz.pl/onas.php>

Krzysztof KOSIOR – ‘Noble Silence’ in Early Buddhism

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-11

According to the Pāli Canon scriptures, keeping silent was a daily practice of the monks from the congregation founded and presided over by Buddha. The article refers to the events and situations in which Buddha and his disciples refrain from speaking. In particular, the attention is focused on two ways of cultivating the so-called ‘noble silence.’ The first one is characteristic of monks not speaking while staying in a group, while the second is an element of the concentration which determines the progress in meditation, as well as accomplishment of freedom from suffering.

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajska*

Keywords: noble silence, Buddhist soteriology, Buddhist monk’s discipline, meditation

Contact: Zakład Religioznawstwa i Filozofii Wschodu, Instytut Filozofii, Wydział Filozofii i Socjologii, Uniwersytet Marii Curie-Skłodowskiej, pl. Marii Curie-Skłodowskiej 4, 20-031 Lublin, Poland

E-mail: krzysztof.kosior@umcs.lublin.pl; krzykosior@wp.pl

Phone: +48 81 5372838

<http://www.umcs.pl/pl/adres-book-employee,1269,pl.html>

Sławomir KAPRALSKI – Silence, Memory, Identity: The Phantasm of a ‘Gypsy’ and the Ambivalence of Modernity

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-12

The article presents an interpretation of the process of mythologizing the Roma by placing them in the role of a ‘significant Other’ in the European modernity. In this process, the real Roma have been substituted by the phantasm of a ‘Gypsy’ which condenses anxieties and repressed desires of modern individuals. The author’s intention is to deconstruct the question of why the Roma keep silence regarding their history, which tacitly—and wrongly—assumes that silence equals forgetting. This question is in the course of the argument substituted with a different one, namely, of why, until very recently, the Roma have been perceived as a people without history, living in an eternal present and disregarding both the past and the future. To provide the answer, the author refers to the Lacanian terminology as employed in the Critical Theory and presents the idea of non-historical ‘Gypsies’ as a phantasm of the split modern subject that constructs ‘Gypsies’ on the one hand as a barbarian obstacle to the process of modernization and, on the other hand, as those whose ‘undeserved pleasure’ is a projection of the repressed dreams of modernity. Next, it is argued that genealogy of memory as studied within memory studies, that is the process that leads from individual memories, through social memory, to collective one and the other way around, is based on the same logic as the genealogy of modern subject and involves coercive mechanisms such as differential deprivation of history, silencing, muting, and erasing of the memories that do not fit the institutionally legitimized vision of history. The Roma are therefore presented here not as silent about their history but as forcibly muted, and the marginalization of their memory as part of their social exclusion. In conclusion, it is argued that the phantasm of a ‘Gypsy’ served as an ideological rationalization of the genocide of the Roma during the Second World War and thus that there is a close affinity between the genealogy of modern subject, the silencing of memory, and the crime of genocide.

Keywords: the Roma/‘Gypsies,’ silence, social memory, subject, modernity, phantasm

Contact: Chair of the Sociology of Culture, Institute of Philosophy and Sociology, Faculty of Humanities, Pedagogical University of Cracow, ul. Podchorążych 2, 30-084 Cracow, Poland

E-mail: Kapral@up.krakow.pl

Phone: +48 12 662 6223

<http://www.ifis.up.krakow.pl/slawomir-kapralski/>

Aleksandra DERRA – Silenced and Forgotten: On the Matilda Effect, or the Systemic Devaluation of Women in Science

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-13

In late 1960's the famous sociologist Robert Merton pointed out that the system of institutional science functions in a very peculiar way, namely, it distributes merits to scientists who are already known. As a result, their papers are cited more frequently and their research is highly evaluated already in advance. Merton called this tendency the 'Matthew Effect' and showed its advantageous results for institutionalized science. More than twenty years later the American historian of science Margaret Rossiter noticed a complementary phenomenon which consists in a division of the recognition of scientific achievements in relation to gender. According to Rossiter, women scientists have been ignored, denied appreciation and sometimes forgotten. She has labelled this phenomenon the 'Matilda Effect' in order to honour the suffragist and feminist critic Matilda Joslyn Gage.

The aim of the present article is to examine specific mechanisms responsible for the systematic erasing of women from the history of science, which is connected with devaluation of their scientific achievements and with a reduction of their role in the development of certain scientific domains. Generally speaking, the 'Matilda Effect' amounts to silencing women in scientific culture. Additionally, the author refers to the ignorance of the gender factor as a significant issue in the critical approach to science. In the article Merton's analysis is juxtaposed with Rossiter's observations. In order to describe the functioning of the 'Matilda effect' in a more detailed way, I discuss the history of the scientific activity of two prominent female scientists: Rosalind Franklin, a chemist and crystallographer, and Ruth Hubbard, a biologist.

Keywords: Matthew Effect, Matilda Effect, feminist studies of science, gender problem in science

Contact: Zakład Filozofii Nauki, Instytut Filozofii, Wydział Humanistyczny, ul. Fosa Staromiejska 1a, 87-100 Toruń, Poland

E-mail: aldewicz@umk.pl

<http://www.aleksandra-derra.eu/kontakt.html>

Monika NOWAK – Areas of Reticence: On Not Speaking as an Element of Shaping the Consciousness of Child and Adolescent Cancer Patients

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-14

In the case of children and adolescents cancer involves a special fear caused by its being a threat to life and a threat of death. Insecurity, aggressive therapy with all its consequences, as well as stigmatization of the patients resulting from the changes in their appearance and the limitation of their active life, give rise to numerous strenuous situations. Fighting cancerous disease is an extreme experience for the sick children and adolescents, as well as for their parents. Informing the patients of their condition belongs among the most difficult prob-

lems of the period of therapy. Based on the scraps of information they receive, children patients usually conceptualize their illness as well as themselves as sick persons. The process in question exemplifies four stages: (1) I am seriously ill. (2) I am seriously ill, but I am going to be well. (3) I am still ill, but I will recover. (4) I am still ill and I will never recover. (5) I am dying. Depending on the effectiveness of the treatment, sick children and adolescents may either stop, at a given stage, their conceptualization of the sickness that affects them or go through all the stages, experiencing death closing in on them.

In order to psychologically survive the period of therapy both sick children and their parents adopt the strategy which consists in 'pretending,' marked by mutual reticence as to the information about the child's actual condition, as well as by numerous taboo issues which are not discussed. Recourse to reticence marks not only the period of the patient's dying, but is made at every stage of therapy and the child's conceptualization of his or her own illness. Reticence concerns issues such as the illness as such, the side effects of the therapy (which affect the patient's appearance), and death (the death of the patient and the death of other patients).

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajka*

Keywords: cancerous disease in children and adolescents, death, taboo, consciousness, mutual pretending

Contact: Uniwersytecki Szpital Dziecięcy w Lublinie, ul. prof. Antoniego Gębali 6, 20-093 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: monika.nowak@poczta.enterpol.pl

Ireneusz ZIEMIŃSKI – On the (Im)Possibility of Interreligious Dialogue

The author attempts to justify the claim that an authentic interreligious dialogue, conceived of as the common pursuit of the truth, is impossible. As the main reason the author indicates the fact that, at the starting point of such a pursuit, it would be necessary for an authentic believer in a religion to suspend his or her faith in the truth of this religion. This condition, however, cannot be accepted by any of the involved parties. Thus interreligious dialogue is possible merely in the form of converting those who believe differently, opposing beliefs considered as false, confirming one's religious identity, or expression of one's beliefs. Similar difficulties apply also to the ecumenical dialogue within Christianity.

Translated by *Patrycja Mikulska*

Keywords: religion, dialogue, faith, God, the Church

Contact: Department of Contemporary Philosophy, Institute of Philosophy, Faculty of Humanities, University of Szczecin, ul. Krakowska 71/79, 71-017 Szczecin, Poland
E-mail: Ireneusz.Zieminski@univ.szczecin.pl
<http://www.us.szc.pl/main.php/zieminski>

Marek SZAJDA – “School had the rank of a shrine.” Fr. Mieczysław Brzozowski’s Reminiscences of His Youth, as seen in the Perspective of His Peers’ Experience: An Oral History Based Study

The late Fr. Mieczysław Brzozowski was a popular and greatly respected personality among members of the Lublin academic circles and those who had the opportunity to know him as a Catholic priest, which is evident from the vivid and cordial commemorative texts. The present article in a way complements Fr. Brzozowski’s last paper, published, incidentally, in the journal *Ethos* in 1991. Based on the testimonies of his peers recorded by means of the method of oral history, the author reconstructs the realities of Stefan Żeromski High School Mieczysław Brzozowski attended, and the town of Jelenia Góra of the late 1940’s, focusing on the profiles of the persons who influenced the future priest’s spiritual choice. Owing to the broader perspective thus attained one may comprehend the background of Fr. Mieczysław Brzozowski’s later patriotic commitment to his homeland, as well as his special sensibility seen in his attitude to others.

The value of the oral history approach used throughout the paper lies in that it helps the readers grasp the climate of the events from seventy years ago, which are now very difficult to reconstruct on the basis of the testimonies of those who actually witnessed them.

Translated by *Dorota Chabrajska*

Keywords: Fr. Mieczysław Brzozowski, Jelenia Góra, Lvov, Maksymilian Tazbir, Fr. Stanisław Turkowski, Polish anti-communist resistance movement until 1950’s, ‘Little Eagles’ Combat Troops, Stefan Żeromski High School in Jelenia Góra

Contact: John Paul II Institute, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: ethos@kul.lublin.pl
Phone: +48 81 4453217

Katarzyna JASIŃSKA– Self-Fulfillment Is a Calling

Review of Inga Mizdrak’s *Ku wolności i samospelnieniu człowieka. Zarys antropologii filozoficznej Karola Wojtyły* [“Towards Human Freedom and Fulfillment: An Outline of Karol Wojtyła’s Philosophical Anthropology”] (Kraków: Uniwersytet Papieski Jana Pawła II. Wydawnictwo Naukowe, 2014).

Contact: John Paul II Institute, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: ethos@kul.lublin.pl
Phone: +48 81 4453217

Krzysztof DYBCIAK – A Scholar Equal to the Writer

Review of Maciej Nowak's *Na łuku elektrycznym. O pisaniu Andrzeja Bobkowskiego* ["In an Electric Arc: On Andrzej Bobkowski's Way of Writing"] (Warszawa: Więź, 2014).

Contact: Katedra Literatury Polskiej XX Wieku, Instytut Filologii Polskiej, Wydział Nauk Humanistycznych, Uniwersytet Kardynała Stefana Wyszyńskiego, ul. Dewajtis 5, 01-815 Warszawa, Poland
E-mail: k.dybciak@upcpoczta.pl

Jakub GUŻYŃSKI – Is Evil Comprehensible?

Review of Marcin Jaranowski's *Rekonstrukcja zła. Etyczne aspekty opresji w świetle refleksji „ocalonych”* ["A Reconstruction of Evil: On the Ethical Aspects of Oppression, as seen in the Light of the Survivors' Reflection"] (Toruń: Wydawnictwo Naukowe Uniwersytetu Mikołaja Kopernika, 2015).

Contact: Zakład Filozofii Nauki, Instytut Filozofii, Wydział Humanistyczny, Uniwersytet Mikołaja Kopernika, ul. Fosa Staromiejska 1a, 87-100 Toruń, Poland
E-mail: guzynsky@gmail.com

Edoardo MARTINELLI – Towards the Anthropological Basis of Manipulation (transl. by K. Zaborowski, SDS)

Review of *Manipulation: Theory and Practice*, ed. Christian Coons and Michael Weber, Oxford University Press, Oxford 2014.

Contact: Department of the Methodology of Science, Institute of Theoretical Philosophy, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: filozofia@libero.it
Phone: +48 81 4454044

Books recommended by *Ethos*

Krzysztof Loska, *Mistrzowie kina japońskiego* ["Masters of Japanese Cinema"] (Kraków: Universitas, 2015).

Fr. Alfred M. Wierzbicki, *Szeroko otwierał drzwi Kościoła* (Lublin: Gaudium, 2016).

Daniel ZAREWICZ – The Vectors of Psychiatry in Modern Society

Report on the Third Open Philosophical-Psychiatric Seminar “The Diagnoses of Modernity,” Faculty of Psychology and Sociology, Maria Curie-Skłodowska University, Lublin, 12-13 November 2015.

Contact: Zakład Literatur i Języków Klasycznych, Instytut Filologii Klasycznej, Wydział Polonistyki, Uniwersytet Warszawski, ul. Krakowskie Przedmieście 1, 00-047 Warsaw, Poland
E-mail: zarewicz@gmail.com
Phone: +48 22 5522903

Ryszard ZAJĄCZKOWSKI – A Reading of Józef Wittlin

Report on an International Conference “Józef Wittlin: A Writer in the Borderland of Cultures,” KUL, Lublin, 29 May 2015.

Contact: Department of the Theory of Culture and Art, Institute of Cultural Studies, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: http://www.kul.pl/contact,art_35393.html
http://www.kul.pl/art_33588.html
<http://www.kul.pl/ryszard-zajaczkowski,24899.html>

Mitchell WELLE, Michael P. MUSIELEWICZ – The Future of Theoretical Philosophy

Report on the OZSW Graduate Conference in Theoretical Philosophy, Radboud University, Nijmegen, 29 April-1 May, 2015

Contact: Department of the Methodology of Science, Institute of Theoretical Philosophy, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: mtwelle@gmail.com (Mitchel Welle); alces@student.kul.lublin.pl (Michael P. Musielewicz)
Phone: +48 81 4454044

Mirosława CHUDA – To Be Silent, and to Be

An essay on the significance of silence and mental asceticism to modern man. The author refers extensively to the Rule of St. Benedict and Eastern Christian Monasticism.

Keywords: silence, mental asceticism, St. Benedict of Nursia, Regula Benedicti, Eastern Christian Monasticism

Contact: John Paul II Institute, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic
University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: ethos@kul.lublin.pl
Phone: +48 81 4453218

Maria FILIPIAK – “In silence and humility...” Popes John Paul II, Benedict XVI and
Francis Preach on Silence and Not Speaking

DOI 10.12887/29-2016-1-113-26

A Bibliography of Addresses by the Pontiffs from 1978 to 2016.

Contact: John Paul II Institute, Faculty of Philosophy, John Paul II Catholic
University of Lublin, Al. Raławickie 14, 20-950 Lublin, Poland
E-mail: ethos@kul.lublin.pl
Phone: +48 81 4453218